Effectiveness of Quality Assurance: How can we prove it?

Martí Casadesús
Director

mcasadesus@aqu.cat
Overview

1. Objectives of external QA in HE
2. QAA context
3. Mission of QAA and effectiveness
4. Incorporating objectives to QAA mission
5. Measuring the effectiveness of QAA
1. Objectives of external QA in HE

The main objectives for external QA in HE are:

- Improving the quality of the HE system
- Promoting accountability of the HE system
2. QAA context

Knowing our own HE system to calibrate the objectives

How is our own HE system?
- Is it compacted / heterogeneous?
- Is it in a process of being reengineered?
- Is it in a process of growing?
- Is it under a policy of public budget expansion?
- Is it experiencing budget cuts?
- Is it working under the principle of autonomy for HE?

The nature of our HE system has big influence on how QA should be articulated and what can be expected as results of QA and its effectiveness.
2. QAA context

Political pressure on the work of QA agencies

Stakeholders with different expectations and different concepts of quality

- Governments want to maximise the (social and electoral) benefits of their public investments
- Universities compete for resources and talent
- Students want to maximise their investment considering HE as a private good
- Etc.
3. Mission of QAA and the effectiveness

Mission A
“ambitious”: improving the quality of HE

Pressure on the QA agency (QA has a power)

What is the balance?

Mission B
“modest”: Providing information that can be used by stakeholders

Pressure on the stakeholders (QA is seen as a service)
3. Mission of QAA and the effectiveness

The way in which QA agencies describe their aims and goals is essential to measure the effectiveness of QA.

Expectations in agencies missions should have a reasonable system to measure their achievements.

Missions require realistic expectations, but ambitious wishes should not be underestimated, even if just realistic goals can be measured.
4. Incorporating objectives to QAA mission

How objectives are incorporated in the missions of QA agencies? What is your balance?

1. Improving the quality HE
   - Some agencies highlight this area

2. Improving the QA management of HEI

3. Providing relevant information for decision makers
   - Some QA agencies prefer to emphasise this aspect
4. Incorporating objectives to QAA mission

How objectives are incorporated in the missions of QA agencies? What is your balance?

1. Improving the quality HE
   - Some agencies highlight this area

2. Improving the QA management of HEI

3. Providing relevant information for decision makers
   - Some QA agencies prefer to emphasise this aspect
4. Incorporating objectives to QAA mission

**Objective 1:** Improving the quality HE

**Example:** Program accreditation
Accreditation impact: ... there is a wide range of opinions...

## Qualitative results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>ACCESS</th>
<th>TEACHING DESIGN</th>
<th>ACADEMIC RESOURCES</th>
<th>GLOBAL PROCESS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>QAA</td>
<td>🟢</td>
<td>🟢</td>
<td>🟢</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNIVERSITY</td>
<td>🟢</td>
<td>🟢</td>
<td>🟥</td>
<td>🟢</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACADEMICS</td>
<td>🟥</td>
<td>🟡</td>
<td>🟥</td>
<td>🟡</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From a Survey accreditation process from AQU Catalunya (2015)
My assessment is positive. This report leads to the conclusion that the commission analysed the proposal in detail and "detected" both specific technical-type deficiencies and more important defects whose correction substantially improved the final proposal. The suggestions and requests were very well-expressed and therefore have proved to be useful. (Respondent 1)

It is an opaque, very bureaucratic process. The emphasis was always on formal aspects with no practical importance, instead of aspects that (at least in my opinion) have a real effect on teaching quality. (Respondent 2)

From a Survey accreditation process from AQU Catalunya (2015)
4. Incorporating objectives to QAA mission

How objectives are incorporated in the missions of QA agencies? What is your balance?

1. Improving the quality HE
   - Some agencies highlight this area

2. Improving the QA management of HEI
   - Some QA agencies prefer to emphasise this aspect

3. Providing relevant information for decision makers
4. Incorporating objectives to QAA mission

Objective 2: Improving the QA management of HEI
Example: WINDDAT: Web-site for HEI system indicators

http://winddat.aqu.cat/
4. Incorporating objectives to QAA mission

How objectives are incorporated in the missions of QA agencies? What is your balance?

1. Improving the quality HE
   - Some agencies highlight this area

2. Improving the QA management of HEI

3. Providing relevant information for decision makers
   - Some QA agencies prefer to emphasise this aspect
4. Incorporating objectives to QAA mission

Objective 3: Providing relevant information for decisions makers

Example: Surveys (employability, employers, graduates...)

Study on the labor market outcomes of graduates
- Graduates, Masters and doctorates
- More than 80,000 surveyed graduates

Employers Survey
- Employers Survey (2014)

Graduates satisfaction Survey
- Satisfaction survey degrees and masters
4. Incorporating objectives to QAA mission

How objectives are incorporated in the missions of QA agencies? What is your balance?

1. Improving the quality HE
   - Some agencies highlight this area

2. Improving the QA management of HEI

3. Providing relevant information for decision makers
   - Some QA agencies prefer to emphasise this aspect
4. Incorporating objectives to QAA mission

Objectives 1&2&3: Improving the quality HE & Improving the QA management of HEI & Providing relevant information for decisions makers

Example: EUC: Website Quality University Programs in Catalonia

http://estudis.aqu.cat
5. Measuring the effectiveness of QAA

How to measure the effectiveness of QAA?

For those agencies looking for their impact on how the quality of HE is improved:

- How to be sure that this is because of QA?
- What is the impact of other factors in that improvement?

Measuring the effectiveness of QAA is not easy!!!
5. Measuring the effectiveness of external QA is not easy

Some **direct measures**: 

Providing information for decision-making processes seems less complicated:

- Use of the reports for taking decisions on HE
- Satisfaction of the users and readers of the reports
- Political decisions related to the evaluations reports
- QAA evaluations
- ....
5. Measuring the effectiveness of external QA is not easy

Some indirect measures:
Exemple: The Catalan University System in International Rankings
5. Measuring the effectiveness of external QA is not easy

Some indirect measures:

Exemple: HE evaluation, Employees & Graduates

And don’t forget that many times...
Thanks very much for your attention